

Legal Research Development

An International Refereed e-Journal

ISSN: 2456-3870, Journal home page: http://www.lrdjournal.com Vol. 09, Issue-II, Dec. 2024



Breaking the Silence: Addressing Marital Rape Through Law Reform

Ankita Singh Kushwah^{*a}.



Dr. Yogini Upadhyay**b,





a Ph.D. Scholar, L.N.C.T. University Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh, (India).

b Assistant Professor, L.N.C.T. University Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh, (India).

KEYWORDS

ABSTRACT

Marital rape, Right, Consent, Justice, Marriage, Human Rights, Victim Rights, Violence, Gender-Based Violence, Consent in Marriage, Frameworks, Legal Law Reform, Criminalization of Marital Rape.

Marital rape, defined by non-consensual sexual intercourse within the institution of marriage, remains a pervasive but often overlooked form of gender-based violence. This research examines the legal and societal dimensions of marital rape in India, emphasizing the violation of autonomy and dignity inherent in such acts. The study critically evaluates existing laws and societal attitudes towards marital rape. Key findings reveal significant gaps in legal protections and societal perceptions that perpetuate gender inequalities and uphold patriarchal norms. The research underscores the urgent need for legal reforms that prioritize bodily autonomy, uphold human rights, and promote gender equality within marital relationships. By framing marital rape within the principles of natural justice, this paper advocates for comprehensive legal reforms like criminalization of marital rape, Awareness program, compensation to the victim for to rebuild their lives and regain a sense of security and well-being after experiencing such profound violations of their rights within the context of marriage. Suggestions aimed at ensuring consistency in addressing sexual violence irrespective of marital status, thereby advancing justice and safeguarding the rights of all individuals affected by marital rape.

Introduction

Marital Rape refers to the forceful or nonconsensual sexual intercourse with one's spouse (it can be male or female) in the institution of marriage. Lack of consent is the most crucial element in defining marital rape. This means that marital rape can happen even without any physical violence. It's about violating someone's autonomy and their right to say no. Marital rape can be a single incident or an ongoing form of abuse within a relationship, showing that it can take many forms. Anyone can be a victim of marital rape, regardless of their gender or sexual orientation. But wives are prone to the marital rape as gender violence is often treated as a matter of family honor resulting in the victim of violence suffering twice over - the physical and mental trauma of her dignity being violated and the perception that it has caused an affront to honor... privacy must not be utilized as a cover to conceal and assert patriarchal mind-sets¹. The ongoing debate regarding the criminalization of the marital rape in India, focus on the bodily autonomy and criminalization is essential for upholding human rights, promoting gender equality,

Corresponding author

4.0 International License

E-mail: rajawatankita482@gmail.com (Ankita Singh Kushwah). **DOI: https://doi.org/10.53724/lrd/v9n2.4

Received 15th Oct. 2024; Accepted 20th Nov. 2024

Available online 30th Dec. 2024





32

and addressing power imbalances within marital relationships. There is a need to protect individuals from sexual violence and ensure legal consistency in addressing rape irrespective of marital status.

Research methodology

The methodology involved a comprehensive approach to gather data and expert opinions, focusing on the critical analysis of existing legal frameworks and conceptualizing marital rape within the framework of natural justice. Data was collected through literature review, and interviews with legal experts and activists specializing in gender rights. The research tries to find flaws in current laws pertaining to marital rape, emphasizing the absence of adequate protection and persisting gender-based violence under the mask of marital privacy. Expert opinions were crucial in understanding the sociolegal dynamics and advocating for reforms that uphold bodily autonomy and human rights within marital relationships. The research employed qualitative analysis to highlight disparities in legal interpretations and societal perceptions, aiming to contribute substantively to the ongoing discourse on criminalizing marital rape in India and promoting gender equality through legal reforms that address power imbalances, right to say no and ensure consistency in addressing sexual violence across marital status.

Laws in India indirectly address Marital rape

Section 375 of IPC², Exception 2 - This exception essentially meant that marital rape was not recognized as an offense under Indian law if the wife was above 15 years of age. However, this provision was challenged

- and partially overturned by the Supreme Court of India in a landmark ruling.
- The Supreme Court Case Independent Thought vs. Union of India & Anr,2017³. Specifically, it held that any sexual act carried out with a wife who is less than eighteen years old would amount to rape and this aligned with Protection of Children from Sexual Offences (POCSO) Act, 2012⁴. The judgment led to a change in the legal age for consent within marriage thereby ensuring uniform protection for minors under Indian law against sexual exploitation regardless of their marital status.
- Section 498A of IPC⁵ deals with cruelty by a husband or his relatives towards the wife. This may involve any intentional act that instigates the woman to suicide, causes grievous hurt or danger to her life, limb, or health whether mentally or physically. Nonconsensual sex can be looked into under this section if it results in such harm. It is meant to check domestic violence and harassment against women, providing for jail term of up to three years and a fine on those who commit such offenses
- Violence Act, 2005⁶, provides civil remedies for victims of domestic violence, including physical, sexual, verbal, emotional, and economic abuse. In the context of marital rape, this Act offers protection by recognizing sexual abuse within marriage as a form of domestic violence.

All above laws only provide indirect way to the

spouse to file a legal suit particularly for the marital rape. If non-consensual sexual intercourse happens in a marriage there are no laws to protect the natural, civil rights of the spouse. Marital rape can occur multiple times which not only damage health but also deteriorate mental health of the spouse. This leads to fear, stress, mental trauma, suicidal inclination and miscarriages. By analyzing these laws, it provides somewhat a license to the husband to physically & sexually exploit the number of times this humiliates a person's dignity and body autonomy.

Marital Rape: Undermining natural and civil rights of the Individual

Marital rape infringes **Right to liberty**⁷ - Imagine being told "no" doesn't matter. That's what marital rape does. It takes away the basic right to say no, to be in control of your own body. Consent is about having a choice, and when that's ripped away in marriage, it's like being turned into an object. It's not just about freedom, it's about being treated with dignity, like a human being who deserves to decide what happens to their own body. Marital rape destroys that, leaving the victim feeling hurt, degraded, and powerless.

The right to equality⁸ Article 14 of the Indian Constitution states that (the state shall not deny to any person equality before law or the equal protection of laws within the territory of India) Although right to equality is a fundamental right but still females are being discriminated when they 're raped by their own husbands. Right to equality is at significant risk due to the deeply entrenched patriarchy that often subsumes women's rights within the institution of marriage. Ideally, marriage

should be a partnership of equals, but the reality is starkly different. Patriarchal norms enable men to enforce their will on their wives, thereby neglecting and undermining the consent and autonomy of women. This dynamic reduces women to objects within their own marriages, stripping them of their agency and voice. Consequently, the prevalence of marital rape becomes a serious issue in societies where patriarchy dominates, as women's rights and personal boundaries are frequently disregarded. This systemic inequality not only perpetuates gender-based violence but also hinders the broader fight for gender equality and women's rights. It's a vicious cycle that needs to be broken.

The concept of natural justice breaks down when faced with marital rape. A wife's fundamental right to bodily integrity and autonomy is blatantly violated when forced sex within marriage remains outside the legal realm. A wife is forced to have sex, her body violated, yet the law offers no protection. This lack of legal recourse for marital rape is a fundamental breach of the principle of "Audi alteram partem" (hear the other side) is a huge blow to women's rights. Their voices are silenced, their bodies treated like property, not their own. Current laws fail to provide natural justice to the victims of the marital rape. Marital rape undermines the Right to Autonomy and Privacy as Enshrined in Article 21, as well as Article 14, which Ensures Equal Protection Under the Law, and Article 15(1) Protecting Against Discrimination.⁹ Exploitation of these rights shows that one spouse dominates and there is a power imbalance in the marriage which sideline the liberty of another spouse. In a healthy marriage, there's trust and respect. But when forced sex goes unpunished, it's a clear sign that something's broken in the system. Women deserve better. They deserve to say no, and to be heard, even within marriage.

Fundamentals and Challenges to address in the law reforms for marital rape

By addressing fundamentals and challenges for law reforms, this will provide bases in suggesting the law reform and addressing the loopholes/gaps in the contemporary laws. India can move towards a better legal framework that effectively protects women's rights and ensures they have equal recourse under the law against the marital rape.

• Addressing the violation of rights within marriage is crucial, particularly in the context of criminalizing marital rape. Fundamental rights that must be protected within the marital framework include the right to equality, freedom, liberty, bodily autonomy, privacy, and the right of choice in sexual activity. The right to equality ensures both partners in a marriage have equal standing and respect, also having an equal right to give or withhold consent. Freedom and liberty within marriage allow individuals to make autonomous decisions without undue influence or control from their partner. The right to say no and bodily autonomy are essential, as they uphold a person's liberty over their own body, emphasizing that consent is important in all sexual activities. The right to privacy ensures that intimate aspects of a person's life are respected and protected from external interference. Lastly, the right of choice in sexual activity underlines the importance of mutual consent and respect in marital relations. Violating any of these rights should invoke legal protections and consequences, including the imposition of marital rape laws on the guilty party. Such measures are necessary to safeguard individuals' fundamental rights and ensure that marriage does not become a shield for abuse or exploitation.

• Diversity in cultures -India's diversity poses a significant challenge in formulating a universal law on marital rape. The complexity stems from the varied marriage traditions different rituals and across communities, where marriage is considered sacred and private from state interference. In India, personal laws governing marriage and related matters are distinct for Hindus, Muslims, Christians, and other communities, each reflecting unique cultural and religious practices. For instance, Hindu marriage rituals differ vastly from those of Muslim weddings, and these personal laws have deep roots in their respective traditions.

Furthermore. societal structures like patriarchy and matriarchy influence how marriages function within different communities. Patriarchal norms¹⁰, which are prevalent in many parts of India, often place women in subordinate roles, potentially complicating the enforcement of marital matriarchal contrast, rape laws. In communities, though fewer, grant women more autonomy, which might affect the

perception and implementation of such laws. Given this diversity, Legal reforms must be inclusive and considerate of these varied practices and preserve the community's faith in the legitimacy of the state while upholding individual rights.

- Proof of burden Proving marital rape is particularly challenging due to the private nature of the crime and the typical absence of witnesses. Often, there is no solid evidence beyond the victim's statement, making it difficult to substantiate claims. To address this, robust reforms are needed to ensure fairness and justice for both the victim and the accused. To maintain an unbiased law, it's crucial to establish clear guidelines on the admissibility of evidence and ensure that the accused has a fair chance to defend themselves. Implementing these measures would help create a balanced legal framework that protects the rights of victims while ensuring the accused are given a fair opportunity to clarify their position
- Misuse The criminalization of marital rape carries the risk of being exploited to lodge false allegations, similar to issues seen with other legal provisions like Section 498A, which addresses dowry-related offenses. In 2020, out of 111,549 registered cases under Section 498A, 5,520 were closed by the police as false¹¹. This suggests that false allegations could also be a concern with marital rape laws. To prevent misuse, the victim's statement should not be considered absolute. While it's important to take

allegations seriously, there should be robust measures to ensure that false cases are not registered. The balanced approach would help protect genuine victims while preventing the misuse of laws.

Law reforms: A necessary Step

There is a need for the law reform as A marriage should never be seen as a license for a husband to forcibly rape his wife. The current exception for marital rape in the Indian Penal Code (IPC) definition of rape was originally based on Victorian-era patriarchal norms embodied in the Doctrine of Coverture¹². This outdated legal principle did not recognize men and women as equals. It prevented married women from owning property and essentially merged their identities with their husbands, treating wives as their husbands' property. Such perspectives are completely out of step with today's understanding of gender equality and individual rights.

• Criminalizing marital rape will protect individual rights and ensure that laws are equal, regardless of marital status. The law should not differentiate between rape committed by a stranger and by a spouse. Instead, it should be clear that rape is a violation of personal autonomy and dignity in any context. Implementing distinct legal categories for one-time offenses and repeated crimes, with harsher punishments for heinous acts of marital rape, will send a strong message that all forms of rape are unacceptable. This approach will not only provide justice to victims but also raise awareness and educate the public about the

36

- importance of consent in all sexual activities.
- Gender neutral law Forming a genderneutral law for marital rape is crucial, as victims can be of any gender. The law should ensure that both men and women are equally protected and that the procedures followed are unbiased. This means that the legal framework should recognize the possibility of both spouses being potential victims and perpetrators, ensuring equal access to justice. Focus on establishing clear, consistent procedures for reporting, investigating, and prosecuting marital rape cases. By adopting a gender-neutral perspective, the legal system can ensure that the rights of all individuals are protected and that justice is served without discrimination.
- Inclusion if J.S. Verma committee¹³ reports and CEDAW recommendation - The Justice J.S. Verma Committee, established after the 2012 Delhi gang rape case, strongly recommended the criminalization of marital rape in its 2013 report. It argued that consent within marriage should not be presumed and that forced sex by a husband should be punishable under the law, just like any other act of rape. Similarly, the UN Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW)¹⁴ has also urged the Indian government to criminalize marital rape. CEDAW's recommendations highlight that the lack of legal recognition for marital rape violates women's rights to equality, personal autonomy, and freedom from

- violence, as guaranteed under international human rights conventions.
- Laws for false allegations in marital rape cases, it's crucial to establish stringent laws that penalize such false claims. Measures could include fines and other consequences to deter individuals from filing false reports. For instance, Section 211 of the Indian Penal Code (IPC)¹⁵ deals with false charges of offense made with the intent to injure, prescribing punishment that include imprisonment and fines. Adapting a similar approach, laws against false accusations of marital rape should ensure that anyone found guilty of intentionally making false claims faces significant penalties. This can help protect the integrity of the legal system and ensure that genuine victims are not overshadowed by false cases.

Conclusion and Suggestion

Addressing marital rape effectively requires comprehensive legal reforms to protect individual rights and ensure marriage is not used as a shield for abuse. Involving community leaders, legal experts, and human rights advocates is crucial for creating laws that are both legally sound and culturally sensitive. This collaborative approach fosters consensus and acceptance across India's diverse society. Such measures not only safeguard genuine victims but also prevent the misuse of laws, promoting fairness and respect within marital relationships. A balanced and inclusive strategy will uphold justice, protect rights, and maintain the integrity of the legal system.

Suggestions

Raising awareness and providing sensitive education about girls' rights against marital rape is crucial. Programs should focus on informing young women about their legal rights, the importance of consent, and available support systems. Schools, community centers, and media campaigns can play key roles in disseminating this information. Educating both men and women about gender equality and respect

Victims of marital rape should receive compensation for both physical and psychological impacts to acknowledge the harm inflicted and provide necessary support. This compensation recognizes the trauma endured, aiming to restore dignity. It reflects a commitment to justice.

Adopting more inclusive and deliberative approach to forming laws as there are diverse culture exist in India. There should be proper data collection, representation from diverse communities.

Another suggestion is that marital rape victims need dedicated counseling and robust support systems tailored to their unique needs. These should include trauma-informed therapy, legal guidance, and community resources to aid recovery and empower them to navigate the emotional and legal challenges they face after such deeply personal violations.

Endnote

¹Marital rape: finding the right to say no ABHINAV MEHROTRA AND KONINA MANDAL

- ² Indian Penal Code (IPC), § Section 375, 1860 (India).
- ³ Independent Thought v. Union of India & Anr., (2017) 10 S.C.C. 800 (India).
- ⁴ Protection of Children from Sexual Offences Act, 2012 (POCSO Act), § [Section 3], No. 32 of 2012 (India).
- ⁵ Indian Penal Code (IPC), § Section 498 A, 1860 (India)
- ⁶ Protection of Women from Domestic Violence Act, 2005 (36 of 2005)
- ⁷ Constitution of India, pt. III, arts. 19,21
- ⁸ Constitution of India, pt. III, arts. 14
- ⁹ Constitution of India, pt. III, arts. 15(!)
- ¹⁰ Saumya Uma: Women's Rights in the Balance as India Weighs Criminalizing Marital Rape, 29th November 2023, https://thediplomat.com/2023/11/womens-rights-in-thebalance-as-india-weighs-criminalizing-marital-rape/, Last seen 20th Seo. 2024.
- ¹¹ National Crime Records Bureau (NCRB). [2020]. Crime in India
- ¹²Justice Verma Committee Report Summary: https://prsindia.org/policy/report-summaries/justice-verma-committee-report-summary, Last Seen: 20th Sep. 2024.
- ¹³Justice Verma Committee Report Summary: https://prsindia.org/policy/report-summaries/justice-vermacommittee-report-summary, Last seen 20th Sep. 2024.
- ¹⁴ General recommendations made by the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women: https://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/recommendations/recomm.htm, Last seen 10th Oct. 2024.
- ¹⁵ Indian Penal Code (IPC), Section 211, 1860 (India).

Other References:

- 1. Randall, M., Koshan, J., & Nyaundi, P. (Eds.). (2017). The Right to Say No: Marital Rape and Law Reform in Canada, Ghana, Kenya, and Malawi. Oxford: Hart Publishing, DOI: 10.5040/9781509902396.
- Venkatesh, V., & Randall, M. (2017). Normative and International Human Rights Law Imperatives for Criminalizing Intimate Partner Sexual Violence: The Marital Rape Impunity in Comparative and Historical Perspective. In M. Randall, J. Koshan, & P. Nyaundi (Eds.), The Right to Say No: Marital Rape and Law Reform in Canada, Ghana, Kenya, and Malawi (pp. 25-48). Oxford: Hart Publishing, DOI: 10.5040/9781509902396.ch-002.
- 3. Makam, G. (2023). Marital Rape Laws in India: Bridging the Gap between Gender Equality and Criminal Justice. SSRN Electronic Journal, DOI: 10.2139/ssrn.4475468.
- 4. Vijeyarasa, R. (2022). The Dark Shadow of Marital Rape: Need to Change the Narrative. Indian Journal of Law and Legal Research, 4(2), 1-15, DOI: 10.1177/26318318221083709.
